

# **SALT LAKE CITY PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING**

**In Room 326 of the City & County Building**

**451 South State Street, Salt Lake City, Utah**

**Wednesday, January 14, 2009**

Present for the Planning Commission meeting were Chair Mary Woodhead and Vice Chair Susie McHugh. Commissioners Babs De Lay, Tim Chambless, Kathy Scott, Prescott Muir, and Matthew Wirthlin.

A field trip was held prior to the meeting. Planning Commissioners present were: Matthew Wirthlin, Mary Woodhead, Prescott Muir, Tim Chambless, and Kathy Scott. Staff members present were: Cheri Coffey, Ray Milliner, and Everett Joyce.

A roll is being kept of all who attended the Planning Commission Meeting. Chair Woodhead called the meeting to order at 5:45 p.m. Audio recordings of the Planning Commission meetings are retained in the Planning Office for an indefinite period of time. Present from the Planning Division: Wilf Sommerkorn, Planning Director; Cheri Coffey, Programs Manager; Paul Neilson, City Attorney; Nole Walkingshaw, Senior Planner; Ray Milliner, Principal Planner; Everett Joyce, Senior Planner; Casey Stewart, Principal Planner; Michael Maloy, Principal Planner; and Lucille Taylor, Administrative Secretary.

**5:50:30 PM Approval of Minutes from Wednesday, November 19, 2008.** Commissioner Scott made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Commissioner De Lay seconded the motion. All in favor voted, “Aye,” the motion passed unanimously.

**5:50:50 PM Approval of Minutes from Wednesday, December 10, 2008.** Vice Chair McHugh made a motion to approve the minutes as written. Commissioner De Lay seconded the motion. Commissioners De Lay and Vice Chair McHugh voted, “Aye”. Commissioners Scott, Muir, and Wirthlin abstained from the vote.

## **5:51:29 PM Report of the Chair and Vice Chair**

Chair Woodhead noted that she and Vice Chair McHugh were in the process of setting up a meeting with the newly appointed Chair and Vice Chair of the City Council. She noted that the Mayor’s Office had made two nominations for new members of the Planning Commission to the City Council.

Chair Woodhead stated that with new members being appointed to the Commission, there should be a PC retreat scheduled in March.

## **5:52:42 PM Report of the Director**

Mr. Sommerkorn noted that he did not have anything new to report.

## **5:53:11 PM Issues Only Hearing**

**Rocky Mountain Power Northeast Substation at 144 South 1100 East**—a request by Rocky Mountain Power, for a conditional use planned development and preliminary subdivision approval in order to reconstruct

and expand electric power capacity to the existing Northeast Substation, located at approximately 144 South 1100 East. The project consists of installation of a new 46/12.5 kilovolt (kV) transformer. The project also includes replacement of obsolete, deteriorated electrical equipment and supporting structures. Associated bus work and circuit breakers will be constructed to meet electrical safety clearance and insulation requirements to accommodate future operation at 138 kilovolts (kV). The project is located in an RMF-30 Low Density Multi-family Residential zoning district. The property is located in City Council District Four, represented by Luke Garrott. [View: Staff Report](#)

- a. **PLNSUB2008-00641 Conditional Use Planned Development**—a request by the applicant for modifications to the front yard, and rear yard setback and buffer requirements, grade changes and fence and wall height.
- b. **PLNSUB2008-00814 Preliminary Subdivision**—a request by the applicant for preliminary approval to combine three lots into one lot for the existing substation.

Chair Woodhead recognized Everett Joyce as staff representative.

#### [6:36:07 PM Public Hearing](#)

The following people spoke or submitted a hearing card in *opposition* to the proposed petition: **Luke Garrott, City Council District Four**, stated he was disappointed in RMP's lack of planning and influence that the City has, and he is opposed to any future conditional use that RMP may have until a utility overlay master plan is written for the City regarding RMP's expansion in the city. **Loggins Merrill, East Central Community Council Chair** (1276 E. Bryan Ave), stated a precedent is being set and this project will have a lasting impact on the neighborhood, so alternatives needed to be looked at. **Esther Hunter, University Neighborhood Council Chair**, stated she agreed that the utility master plan did need to be written and put into place; she would like to see city experts review the consequences of the emissions of a more powerful substation. **Doug Harding** (152 South 1100 East) stated he had issues with PCB's, which is a class of chemicals used in the power business to cool transformers, he was concerned that the surrounding soil had been polluted with these chemicals, and they are a biohazard. **Lawrence Eckman** (1116 East 400 South) stated he did not want additional humming noises, and did not think the upgrade was necessary. **Elaine Bell** (1014 East 200 South) stated she would like to see solar energy options for this transformer, and updated the wires. **Jerry Wroble** (115 South 1100 East #708) stated it was time to consider long-term solutions for power generation, and stated that this would ruin the historic preservation in the area. **Donna Chin** (3501 South 3685 East) stated she was concerned about the increased health risks. **Sarah Brenna** (115 South 1100 East #708) stated that the upgrade would ruin the view corridor, and the historical character of the neighborhood. **Steve Williams** (115 South 1100 East #312) stated that this would cause additional health risks, ruin the view corridor, and was not "green" building. **Stuart Handwerker, MD** (115 South 1100 East #801) stated that there were many health risks involved with living close to the power station, he suggested that the only improvement made to this substation should be to place it underground. **Shelley White** (159 South McClelland Street) stated that there were 69 children in the neighborhood under eleven years old, and living next to a power station has been known to cause cancer, she is opposed to the increase of power because of this risk. She also submitted a video depicting the tree and the bird life in it. **Kathryn Stockton** (159 South McClelland Street) stated that she did not agree with the plans for cutting down and pruning trees in the area. There is one big tree in the area that blocks the view of the substation and houses a lot of birds and it seems to not be an environmentally healthy project for the neighborhood. She stated that she would be willing to pay the cost for the future maintenance of the tree if it were not cut down. RMP is also massively impacting the values of the homes in the neighborhood for future sale. **Spencer Hogan** (1124 East Bueno Avenue) stated that aesthetically this is not a good project because of

the loss of the view corridor. **Ray Kingston** (1070 East 400 South) stated he did not want to see the trees removed. **Vicki Williams** (115 South 1100 East #312) stated that this substation should be placed underground. **Tamara Rowe** (415 East 600 South) stated that she was concerned about the health of the children living and playing in the neighborhood. **Chris Weed** (115 South 1100 East #808) stated that he did not feel it was necessary to build the substation higher, he would rather see it placed underground. **Lisa Heaton** (House of Hope) stated that she runs the child care facility, which helps high risk children and she is hoping that they are not adding a health risk to these children's lives. **Ed Kent** (115 South 1100 East #807) stated he was concerned about the lost view corridor and the loss of property values in the future. **Debbie Feder** (354 South 1100 East) stated that she suffered thyroid cancer from the effects of the environmental; she is concerned that the four-fold increase in power will cause her additional health risks. **Shawn Neugebauer** (137 South 1100 East) stated he was concerned with noise and light pollution, and RMP was giving ambiguous information. **Stephen Prather** (344 South 1100 East) stated he was concerned with the loss of the view corridor. **Stan Rodriguez** (115 South 1100 East #612). **Rebecca Merrill** (115 South 1100 East #808) stated that she was concerned about security and safety around the substation and inquired if RMP had plans to mitigate this. **Rose Bridwell** (857 East 200 South) stated that she agreed with the previous testimony that had been given in opposition to this project. **Kami Summers** (857 East 200 South) stated that a bigger substation in a family neighborhood was not the answer. **Charice Smith** (857 East 200 South) stated she agreed with the testimony in opposition that had been given. **Olivia Moreton** (115 South 1100 East #802) stated that other technologies should be explored more thoroughly before this petition was approved. **Dana Petersen** (1355 South 400 East) stated that he felt a lot of this power would not be used for the neighborhood where it exists, but for million dollar homes miles away, and he did not want to live with higher power rates because of monster homes; this did not seem fair. **Robert Forbis** (1340 Harrison Avenue) stated that the substation should be placed underground, not modernized, the above ground space could be utilized as open space or a solar power facility. **Max Deneris** (1134 East 700 South) stated he did not want heavier lines and poles running through the neighborhood. **Don Maxfield** (126 McClelland Street) stated the place was an eyesore. **Virg Merrill** (1079 East 2006) in opposition. **Sara Merrill** (1079 East 200 South) in opposition. **Aaron Fogelson** (354 South 1100 East) stated he was very concerned with the prospect of numerous and higher voltage power lines running through the neighborhood, and he felt the process was piecemeal and disorderly. **Don Noble** (115 South 1100 East) in opposition. **Nancy Starks** (336 South 100 East) stated this would be a health hazard to all in the neighborhood. **David Starks** (336 South 1100 East) in opposition. **Hank Liese** (462 South 1100 East) stated he was opposed. **Joy Emory** (212 South 1100 East) stated there should be further studies, this would destroy the historic quality of the neighborhood and would have adverse health effects and noise. **Kelli Hansen** (880 East 100 South #3) does not want this in the neighborhood. **Mark Thomas** (880 East 100 South #3) in opposition. **Martha McLaughlin** (153 Windsor Street) stated that this proposal threatens a non-profit child daycare center that serves over 40 children and their mothers. **Tara Rumsey** (857 East 200 South) stated opposition. **Patricia Ainsworth** (857 East 200 South) stated she believed this would affect the children's health. **Tanya Garcia** (857 East 200 South) stated that this proposal would cause possible health problems for the children and families in the neighborhood. **John Morton** (115 South 1100 East #802) stated other alternatives should be looked at. **Greta Belanger de Jong** (140 South McClelland Street) stated that new technologies were just around the corner; please put a greater effort into encouraging conservation until a master plan is accomplished. **Bruce Spieger** (475 South 7200 South) stated there is a lack of context sensitivity. **Carole Maxfield** (126 McClelland Street) in opposition. [View: Additional Public Comment; Pruning Hurts Trees; University Neighborhood Organization comments.](#)

Chair Woodhead closed the public hearing portion of the issues only hearing.

Chair Woodhead announced a small break at 8:07 p.m.

Chair Woodhead reconvened the meeting at 8:18 p.m.

[8:18:47 PM](#) **Commission Wirthlin made a motion to formally adopt the dates scheduled for the 2009 Planning Commission Meetings.**

**Commissioner Chambless seconded the motion.**

**All in favor voted, “Aye”, the motion carried unanimously.**

## ***Public Hearings***

[8:20:05 PM](#) **Rosewood Senior Housing Project Master Plan Map and Zoning Map Amendments, and Street Closure**—a request by the Housing Authority of Salt Lake City, represented by Executive Director Bill Nighswonger, for approval for a 75 unit senior housing development located at approximately 158 North 600 West and approximately 171—187 North Phoenix Circle. The property is located in City Council District Three represented by Eric Jergensen. [View: Staff Report](#)

- a. **Petition PLNPCM2008-00466 Master Plan Amendment**—the applicant is requesting approval to amend the Capitol Hill Community Master Plan’s Future Land Use Map for the property from Low Density Residential (1-15 dwelling units/acre) to Medium High Density Residential (30-50 dwelling units/acre).
- b. **Petition PLNPCM-00470 Zoning Map Amendment**—the applicant is requesting approval to rezone the property from SR-3 and SR-1A Special Development Pattern Residential to RMF-45 Residential Multi-Family.
- c. **Petition PLNSUB-00615 Street Closure and Declaration of Surplus Property**—the applicant is requesting that the City close platted, but unimproved Phoenix Circle (located at approximately 560 West at 200 North).

Chair Woodhead recognized Ray Milliner as the staff representative.

## [8:30:17 PM](#) **Public Hearing**

Chair Woodhead opened the public hearing portion of the petition; she noted that there were no members of the public present to speak to this petition. Chair Woodhead closed the public hearing.

[8:30:57 PM](#) **Motion** (Petition PLNPCM2008-00466 Master Plan Amendment):

**Commissioner De Lay made a motion, based on testimony and the staff report, regarding Petition PLNPCM2008-00466, that the Planning Commission amend the Capitol Hill Master Plan Amendment from Low Density Residential to Medium High Density Residential.**

**Commissioner Chambless seconded the motion**

**Commissioners De Lay, Chambless, Scott, Muir, Wirthlin, and McHugh voted, “Aye”. The motion carried unanimously.**

[8:31:38 PM](#) **Motion** (Petition PLNPCM-00470 Zoning Map Amendment):

**Commissioner De Lay made a motion regarding Petition PLNPCM-00470 Zoning Map Amendment, that the Planning Commission approve the rezone of the property from SR-3 and SR-1A Special Development Pattern Residential to RMF-45 Residential Multi-Family.**

**Commissioner Chambless seconded the motion.**

**Commissioners De Lay, Chambless, Scott, Muir, Wirthlin, and McHugh voted, “Aye”. The motion carried unanimously.**

[8:32:29 PM](#) **Motion** (Petition PLNSUB-00615 Street Closure and Declaration of Surplus Property):

**Commissioner De Lay made a motion regarding Petition PLNSUB-00615 street closure and declaration of surplus property, based upon testimony and the staff report, the Planning Commission close platted, but unimproved Phoenix Circle, located at approximately 560 West 200 North.**

**Commissioner Chambless seconded the motion.**

**Commissioners De Lay, Chambless, Scott, Muir, Wirthlin, and McHugh voted, “Aye”. The motion carried unanimously.**

[8:33:29 PM](#) **PLNPCM2008-00347, Central City Recreation Center Zoning Amendment**—a request by Salt Lake County to amend the City zoning map for the property located at approximately 615 South 300 East so that the entire property is zoned PL (Public Lands). The subject property is the current location of the Central City Recreation Center and currently has a split zoning designation of Multi-Family RMF-35 and PL. The property is located in City Council District Four, represented by Luke Garrett. [View: Staff Report](#)

Chair Woodhead recognized Casey Stewart as the staff representative.

[8:39:17 PM](#) **Public Hearing**

Chair Woodhead opened the public hearing portion of the petition.

The following people spoke or submitted a hearing card in *support* of the proposed petition: **Scott Schoenebeck** (PO Box 520115) stated he was concerned about the zoning; he would like to see additional drawings before the revisions. If this was just a map change and the construction would not affect the neighborhood, he was in support of the petition. **Steve Scoville** (228 East 500 South #101) stated he was concerned if there were going to be screen walls for the dumpsters, but supported the petition other than that. He was directed by the Commission to go talk to the applicant while they were starting construction, and maybe have some say in the best place for the dumpsters. **Cindy Cromer** (816 East 100 South) stated that she would like planning staff to get a better grip on mapping errors, be more proactive so that development processes are not expensively interrupted when they find out the zoning is wrong. She stated that landscaping, especially trees are misplaced in the center of asphalt parking lots, and increased parameter landscaping would be more appropriate, which the ordinance does not allow, but this should be looked at in the future.



Chair Woodhead closed the public hearing portion of the petition.

**8:45:11 PM Motion:**

**Commissioner Wirthlin made a motion regarding Petition PLNPCM2008-00347, based on findings in the staff report, and discussion, the Planning Commission transmits a positive recommendation to the City Council for the rezone, due to a mapping error.**

**Vice Chair McHugh seconded the motion.**

**Commissioners De Lay, Chambless, Scott, Muir, Wirthlin, and McHugh voted, “Aye”. The motion carried unanimously.**

**8:45:57 PM PLNPCM2008-00744, Autozone Planned Development Amendment**—a request by The Boyer Co., represented by Nate Swain, for a conditional use to amend a recently approved planned development to include a monument sign. The pad site for the proposed Autozone auto parts retail building is not a separate lot and therefore is not eligible, per the sign ordinance, for its own monument sign. The subject site is located at approximately 1199 East 3300 South, at the south entrance to Brickyard Plaza, in a CB zoning district. The property is located in City Council District Seven, represented by Søren Simonsen. [View: Staff Report](#)

Chair Woodhead recognized Casey Stewart as the staff representative.

**8:52:13 PM Public Hearing**

Chair Woodhead opened the public hearing portion of the petition.

The following people spoke or submitted a hearing card in *opposition* to the proposed petition: **Michael Fife** stated that this sign would seem redundant.

**8:57:43 PM Motion:**

**Commissioner Scott made a motion, based on discussion and the staff report, regarding Petition PLNPCM2008-00744 (410-08-39) that the Planning Commission deny the request for a conditional use to amend the recently approved planned development to include a monument sign.**

**Commissioner Chambless seconded the motion.**

**Commissioners De Lay, Chambless, Scott, and McHugh voted, “Aye”. Commissioners Muir, and Wirthlin voted, “No”. The motion carried.**

**8:58:47 PM PLNSUB2008-00574 View of the Valley (VoV) Planned Development**—a request by Ronaldo Hunt for a redevelopment of existing Sugar House cottages located at approximately 1325 East 2100 South into a new single building, mixed use project (retail, office, residential). Project seeks relief from lot size maximum limit of 16, 500 sq ft in the CN district. This property is located in City Council District Six, represented by J.T. Martin.

Chair Woodhead noted that Petition PLNSUB2008-00574 was postponed.

[8:58:53 PM](#) **400-08-10 Crestview Holdings Master Plan Amendment**—a request by Juston Puchar, with Crestview Holdings, for a master plan amendment located at approximately 356 North and 358 North Redwood Road. The applicant proposes amendment of the Northwest Community Future Land Use Plan for the subject property from Parks/Open Space to Medium Density Residential to accommodate an eight (8) unit multi-family residential development. The property is located in City Council District Two represented by Van Turner.

View: [Staff Report](#)

Chair Woodhead recognized Michael Maloy as staff representative.

#### [9:20:02 PM](#) **Public Hearing**

Chair Woodhead opened the public hearing portion of the petition; she noted that there were no members of the public present to speak to this petition. Chair Woodhead closed the public hearing.

#### [9:23:20 PM](#) **Motion:**

**Commissioner Scott made a motion regarding Petition 400-08-10, to amend the Northwest Community Future Land Use Plan map from Open Space to Medium Density Residential for property located at approximately 356-358 North Redwood Road, that the Planning Commission transmit a negative recommendation to the City Council, based on discussion and the findings listed in the staff report.**

**Commissioner Chambless seconded the motion.**

**Commissioners De Lay, Chambless, Scott, Muir, Wirthlin, and McHugh voted, “Aye”. The motion carried unanimously.**

[9:24:46 PM](#) **410-08-55, PLNPCM2008-00187, McGillis School Conditional Use**—a request by the McGillis School, represented by Glen W. Anderson, for a Conditional Use to allow for additional height on the proposed addition to the existing building at approximately 668 South 1300 East in the Institutional Zoning District. The height of the proposed building is approximately 38.5 feet (with additional height extensions for decorative features to match surrounding architecture), consistent with the height of the existing school building. The ordinance allows heights over 35 feet, but less than 75 feet, as a conditional use in the Institutional Zoning District. The property is located in City Council District Four, represented by Luke Garrott. View: [Staff Report](#)

Chair Woodhead recognized Cheri Coffey as staff representative.

#### [9:36:59 PM](#) **Public Hearing**

Chair Woodhead opened the public hearing portion of the petition.

The following people spoke or submitted a hearing card in *support* for the proposed petition: **Cindy Cromer** (816 East 100 South) stated she was very happy with the petition, she had concerns with the awnings on the south side of the building, but no concerns regarding the additional height that has been requested. She stated that despite the huge acreage, this property does not qualify for a PUD.

Chair Woodhead closed the public hearing.

**9:41:08 PM Motion:**

**Commissioner Wirthlin made a motion regarding the McGillis School, Petition PLNPCM2008-00187 (410-08-55), based on findings listed in the staff report, discussion, and the public hearing, the Planning Commission approves the petition for a conditional use for additional height.**

**Commissioner Muir seconded the motion.**

**Commissioners De Lay, Chambless, Scott, Muir, Wirthlin, and McHugh voted, “Aye”. The motion carried unanimously.**

*The meeting adjourned at 9:43 p.m.*

**This document, along with the digital recording, constitute the official minutes of the Salt Lake City Planning Commission held on January 14, 2009.**

***Go to FTR Gold at <ftp://ftrftp.slcgov.com/FTRPlayerPlusV21.exe> to download the digital recording.***

---

Tami Hansen